



Spatio-temporal distribution of Dengue, Zika and Chikungunya in Cali, Colombia: 2014-2016

Distribución espaciotemporal de dengue, Zika y Chikunguña en Cali, Colombia: 2014-2016

Distribuição espaço temporal de Dengue, Zika e Chikungunya em Cali, Colômbia: 2014-2016

José F. Fuertes-Bucheli¹ orcid.org/0000-0002-3810-4943

Gladys Pérez-Arizabaleta² orcid.org/0000-0002-2358-266X

Andrea Quiroz-Caicedo² orcid.org/0000-0002-5832-7386

Robin A. Olaya³ orcid.org/0000-0001-7956-3612

Hoover O. León-Giraldo² orcid.org/0000-0002-8854-105X

Robinson Pacheco-López^{1,2*} orcid.org/0000-0003-2525-9935

1. Facultad de Ciencias de la Salud, Medicina, Universidad Icesi. Cali, Colombia.
2. Grupo de Investigación Esculapio, Universidad Libre. Cali, Colombia.
3. Escuela de Ingeniería Civil y Geomática, Universidad del Valle. Cali, Colombia.

Received: Aug 17 - 2022

Revised: May 29 - 2022

Accepted: Sept 29 - 2023

Published: Aug 15 - 2024

Citation: Fuertes-Bucheli JF, Pérez-Arizabaleta G, Quiroz-Caicedo A, Olaya RA, León-Giraldo H, Pacheco-López R. Spatio-temporal distribution of Dengue, Zika and Chikungunya in Cali, Colombia: 2014-2016. *Univ. Salud.* 2024;26(3):A19-A26. DOI: 10.22267/rus.242603.330

Abstract

Introduction: Emerging and re-emerging arboviral infections have become a public health challenge in the Americas due to their epidemic potential. **Objective:** To determine the spatio-temporal distribution of the dengue, Zika, and chikungunya viruses during an epidemic period in Cali, Colombia. **Materials and methods:** Multi-method descriptive ecological and exploratory study of confirmed and suspected cases reported to the epidemiological surveillance system between 2014 and 2016. **Results:** 40,168 cases were analyzed, and it was found that dengue was the most frequent arboviral infection (59.2%). The most affected individuals were women (65%) and those with a mean age of 34.5 years. Although arboviral infections spread out throughout the city, the three diseases were concentrated in significant groups located at the center-east and northeast areas of Cali ($p < 0.01$; $z = -203.7$). **Conclusions:** This study identified critical zones for the three arboviral infections, which are located in areas with low socioeconomic status. Likewise, the results suggest that in addition to eco-epidemiological and bio-psychosocial factors, temperature, precipitation, and the aedic index may play an important role in the spatio-temporal behavior of these diseases. A multidisciplinary and collaborative approach is necessary, which must involve communities and authorities to implement effective control strategies, especially during epidemic periods.

Keywords: Vector borne diseases; arbovirus infections; disease outbreaks; space-time clustering. (Source: DeCS, Bireme).

Resumen

Introducción: Las arbovirosis emergentes y reemergentes representan un reto de salud pública en las Américas, debido a su potencial epidémico. **Objetivo:** Determinar la distribución espaciotemporal de los virus del dengue, el Zika y el chikunguña, en un periodo epidémico en Cali. **Materiales y métodos:** Estudio multimétodo descriptivo y ecológico exploratorio de casos confirmados y presuntos notificados al sistema de vigilancia epidemiológica, entre 2014 y 2016. **Resultados:** Se analizaron 40.168 casos, se encontró que el dengue fue la arbovirosis más frecuente (59,2%). Los individuos más afectados tenían una edad media de 34,5 años y eran predominantemente mujeres (65%). Las arbovirosis se distribuyeron en toda la ciudad, pero se identificaron agrupamientos significativos en el centro-este y noreste de Cali para las tres enfermedades ($p < 0,01$; $z = -203,7$). **Conclusión:** Este estudio destaca la identificación de zonas críticas para las tres arbovirosis que se localizan en áreas con rezago socioeconómico. Además, los resultados sugieren que factores eco-epidemiológicos y biopsicosociales adicionales a la temperatura, las precipitaciones y el índice aédico pueden desempeñar un papel importante en el comportamiento espaciotemporal de estas enfermedades. Se recomienda una aproximación multidisciplinaria y colaborativa, involucrando a la comunidad y las autoridades, para implementar estrategias de control efectivas, especialmente durante periodos epidémicos.

Palabras clave: Enfermedades transmitidas por vectores; infecciones por arbovirus; brotes de enfermedades; agrupamiento espacio-temporal. (Fuente: DeCS, Bireme).

Resumo

Introdução: Arbovírus emergentes e reemergentes representam um desafio de saúde pública nas Américas, devido ao seu potencial epidêmico. **Objetivo:** Determinar a distribuição espaço-temporal dos vírus dengue, Zika e chikungunya, em período epidêmico em Cali. **Materiais e métodos:** Estudo multimétodo, descritivo e ecológico exploratório de casos confirmados e suspeitos notificados ao sistema de vigilância epidemiológica, entre 2014 e 2016. **Resultados:** foram analisados 40.168 casos, constatou-se que a dengue foi a arbovirose mais frequente (59,2%). Os indivíduos mais acometidos tinham idade média de 34,5 anos e eram predominantemente mulheres (65%). Os arbovírus foram distribuídos por toda a cidade, mas foram identificados aglomerados significativos no centro-leste e nordeste de Cali para as três doenças ($p < 0,01$; $z = -203,7$). **Conclusão:** Este estudo destaca a identificação de zonas críticas para as três arboviroses que estão localizadas em áreas com atraso socioeconômico. Além disso, os resultados sugerem que fatores eco-epidemiológicos e biopsicosociais adicionais à temperatura, à precipitação e ao índice aedico podem desempenhar um papel importante no comportamento espaço-temporal destas doenças. Recomenda-se uma abordagem multidisciplinar e colaborativa, envolvendo a comunidade e as autoridades, para implementar estratégias de controle eficazes, especialmente durante períodos epidêmicos.

Palavras chave: Doenças transmitidas por vetores; infecções por arbovirus; surtos de doenças; conglomerados espaço-temporais. (Fonte: DeCS, Bireme).

*Corresponding Author

Robinson Pacheco-López
e-mail: robinson.pachecol@unilibre.edu.co

used communication media and with evidence-based methodologies⁽³³⁻³⁵⁾; (iii) vector control, which should combine individual activities of the communities to eliminate breeding sites and other control strategies, especially in the highest risk areas⁽³⁶⁾; and (iv) comprehensive approach of other HSDs⁽³²⁾ such as social and economic support, involvement of communities in their own care, reduction of violence in the city, infrastructure improvement, problems related to climate change, and access and safe storage of drinking water.

Conclusions

This spatio-temporal study has identified critical areas from the center-east and northeast of Cali, which are at risk for dengue, Zika, and chikungunya viral infections during an epidemic period, due to its environmental and geographical conditions. The observed spatio-temporal behavior of these pathogens could not be explained only by factors such as the temperature, precipitation and aedic index during epidemic periods. Thus, further research that includes additional variables is needed. However, the evidence presented here suggests that the behavior of these arboviral infections could be affected by interactions of environmental, entomological, epidemiological, and psycho-behavioral factors. Therefore, an inter-institutional and multidisciplinary collaborative approach is suggested in order to control arbovirus epidemics in Cali. This proposed strategy must involve communities and cover aspects such as epidemiological surveillance, risk communication, vector control, and the comprehensive approach of other potential HSDs.

This study faced several limitations. First of all, only a few of multiple variables that could affect the arboviruses behavior were evaluated. Nevertheless, all available data were included in the study. Secondly, the sources of information had considerable under-recording issues, which is why ethnicity and employment of patients were excluded from this study. Thus, effective strategies to verify the quality of the information reported to Sivigila are needed. Finally, additional under-registration issues could be caused by economic, social, and multi-causal difficulties, which impeded proper access to health care. However, we were able to report findings that are consistent with previous studies regarding the spatio-temporal distribution of arboviral infections.

Funding sources: The resources were provided by the research fund of the Libre University, Cali.

Conflict of interest: the authors declare none.

References

- Balakrishnan VS. WHO launches global initiative for arboviral diseases. *Lancet Microbe* [Internet]. 2022;3(6):e407. DOI: 10.1016/s2666-5247(22)00130-6
- Wilder-Smith A, Gubler DJ, Weaver SC, Monath TP, Heymann DL, Scott TW. Epidemic arboviral diseases: priorities for research and public health. *Lancet Infect Dis* [Internet]. 2017;17(3):e101–e106. DOI: 10.1016/S1473-3099(16)30518-7
- Espinal MA, Andrus JK, Jauregui B, Waterman SH, Morens DM, Santos JI, et al. Emerging and reemerging aedes-transmitted arbovirus infections in the region of the americas: Implications for health policy. *Am J Public Health* [Internet]. 2019;109(3):387–392. DOI: 10.2105/AJPH.2018.304849
- Dick OB, San Martín JL, Montoya RH, del Diego J, Zambrano B, Dayan GH. The History of Dengue Outbreaks in the Americas. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* [Internet]. 2012;87(4):584–593. DOI: 10.4269/AJTMH.2012.11-0770
- Vyhmeister E, Provan G, Doyle B, Bourke B. Multi-cluster and environmental dependant vector born disease models. *Heliyon* [Internet]. 2020;6(9):e04090. DOI: 10.1016/j.heliyon.2020.e04090
- Ramirez B, on behalf of the TDR-IDRC Research Initiative on Vector Borne Diseases and Climate Change. Support for research towards understanding the population health vulnerabilities to vector-borne diseases: Increasing resilience under climate change conditions in Africa. *Infect Dis Poverty* [Internet]. 2017;6(1):164. DOI: 10.1186/S40249-017-0378-Z
- Benedum CM, Seidahmed OME, Eltahir EAB, Markuzon N. Statistical modeling of the effect of rainfall flushing on dengue transmission in Singapore. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* [Internet]. 2018;12:e0006935. DOI: 10.1371/JOURNAL.PNTD.0006935
- Arcari P, Tapper N, Pfueller S. Regional variability in relationships between climate and dengue/DHF in Indonesia. *Singap J Trop Geogr* [Internet]. 2007;28(3):251–272. DOI: 10.1111/J.1467-9493.2007.00300.X
- Rodríguez RC, Carrasquilla G, Porras A, Galera-Gelvez K, Yescas JGL, Rueda-Gallardo JA. The Burden of Dengue and the Financial Cost to Colombia, 2010–2012. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* [Internet]. 2016;94(5):1065–1072. DOI: 10.4269/AJTMH.15-0280
- Freitas LP, Carabali M, Yuan M, Jaramillo-Ramirez GI, García Balaguera C, Restrepo BN, et al. Spatio-temporal clusters and patterns of spread of dengue, chikungunya, and Zika in Colombia. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* [Internet]. 2022;16(8):e0010334. DOI: 10.1371/JOURNAL.PNTD.0010334
- Cuéllar L, Concepción M, Ramírez B, Álvarez ÁM, Díaz C. Los sistemas de información geográfica y su empleo en un sistema de vigilancia integrado para la prevención del dengue en un municipio de ciudad de La Habana. *GeoFocus* [Internet]. 2014;(9):166–183. Available from: <https://www.geofocus.org/index.php/geofocus/article/view/186>
- Ordoñez-Sierra G, Sarmiento-Senior D, Jaramillo Gomez JF, Giraldo P, Porras Ramírez A, Olano VA. Multilevel analysis of social, climatic and entomological factors that influenced dengue occurrence in three municipalities in Colombia. *One Health* [Internet]. 2021;12:100234. DOI: 10.1016/J.ONEHLT.2021.100234
- Eastin MD, Delmelle E, Casas I, Wexler J, Self C. Intra- and Interseasonal Autoregressive Prediction of Dengue Outbreaks Using Local Weather and Regional Climate for a Tropical Environment in Colombia. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* [Internet]. 2014;91(3):598–610. DOI: 10.4269/AJTMH.13-0303
- Corporación Autónoma Regional del Valle del Cauca (CVC). Portal GeoCVC [Internet]. Valle del Cauca (COL): CVC; 2014. Available from: <https://geo.cvc.gov.co>
- Rodríguez-Morales AJ, Galindo-Marquez ML, García-Loaiza CJ, Sabogal-Roman JA, Marin-Loaiza S, Ayala AF, et al. Mapping Zika virus disease incidence in Valle del Cauca. *Infection* [Internet]. 2017;45(1):93–102. DOI: 10.1007/S15010-016-0948-1
- Rico-Mendoza A, Porras-Ramírez A, Chang A, Encinales L, Lynch R. Co-circulation of dengue, chikungunya, and Zika viruses in Colombia from 2008 to 2018. *Rev Panam Salud Publica* [Internet]. 2019;43:e49. DOI: 10.26633/RPSP.2019.49
- Villamil-Gómez W, Restom Merlano J, Bonilla-Aldana K, Salas-Matta LA, Rodríguez-Morales AJ. Arbovirosis endemoepidémicas. *Medicine - Programa de Formación Médica Continuada Acreditado*. 2022;13(58):3398–3414. DOI: 10.1016/J.MED.2022.05.030
- Caicedo-Hurtado MI, Castillo-Valencia M. Tipologías de pobreza en Cali: un análisis con base en el SISBEN. *Tendencias* [Internet]. 2021;22(1):39–70. DOI: 10.22267/RTEND.202102.154
- Santos LLM, de Aquino EC, Fernandes SM, Ternes YMF, Feres VCR. Dengue, chikungunya, and Zika virus infections in Latin America and the Caribbean: a systematic review. *Rev Panam Salud Publica* [Internet]. 2023;47:e34. DOI: 10.26633/RPSP.2023.34
- Gomes Mol MP, Matos Quiroz JT, Gomes J, Heller L. Gestión adecuada de los residuos sólidos como factor de protección

- contra los casos de dengue. *Rev Panam Salud Publica* [Internet]. 2020;44:e22. DOI: 10.26633/RPSP.2020.22
21. Krystosik AR, Curtis A, Labeaud AD, Dávalos DM, Pacheco R, Buritica P, et al. Neighborhood Violence Impacts Disease Control and Surveillance: Case Study of Cali, Colombia from 2014 to 2016. *Int J Environ Res Public Health* [Internet]. 2018;15(10):2144. DOI: 10.3390/IJERPH15102144
 22. Delmelle E, Hagenlocher M, Kienberger S, Casas I. A spatial model of socioeconomic and environmental determinants of dengue fever in Cali, Colombia. *Acta Trop* [Internet]. 2016;164:169–176. DOI: 10.1016/J.ACTATROPICA.2016.08.028
 23. Krystosik AR, Curtis A, Buritica P, Ajayakumar J, Squires R, Dávalos D, et al. Community context and sub-neighborhood scale detail to explain dengue, chikungunya and Zika patterns in Cali, Colombia. *PLoS ONE* [Internet]. 2017;12(8):e0181208. DOI: 10.1371/JOURNAL.PONE.0181208
 24. Espinoza-Gomez F, Newton-Sanchez OA, Nava-Zavala AH, Zavala-Cerna MG, Rojas-Larios F, Delgado-Enciso I, et al. Demographic and climatic factors associated with dengue prevalence in a hyperendemic zone in Mexico: an empirical approach. *Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg* [Internet]. 2021;115:63–73. DOI: 10.1093/TRSTMH/TRAA083
 25. Bhatia S, Bansal D, Patil S, Pandya S, Ilyas QM, Imran S. A Retrospective Study of Climate Change Affecting Dengue: Evidences, Challenges and Future Directions. *Front Public Health* [Internet]. 2022;10:884645. DOI: 10.3389/FPUBH.2022.884645
 26. Nguyen VH, Tuyet-Hanh TT, Mulhall J, Van Minh H, Duong TQ, Van Chien N, et al. Deep learning models for forecasting dengue fever based on climate data in Vietnam. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* [Internet]. 2022;16(6):e0010509. DOI: 10.1371/JOURNAL.PNTD.0010509
 27. Li L, Fang Z, Zhou H, Tang Y, Wang X, Liang G, et al. Dengue Risk Forecast with Mosquito Vector: A Multicomponent Fusion Approach Based on Spatiotemporal Analysis. *Comput Math Methods Med* [Internet]. 2022;2022:2515432. DOI: 10.1155/2022/2515432
 28. Cassab A, Morales V, Mattar S. Factores climáticos y casos de Dengue en Montería, Colombia. 2003-2008. *Rev Salud Pública* [Internet]. 2011;13(1):115–128. Available from: <https://revistas.unal.edu.co/index.php/revsaludpublica/article/view/33540>
 29. Yavari Nejad F, Varathan KD. Identification of significant climatic risk factors and machine learning models in dengue outbreak prediction. *BMC Med Inform Decis Mak* [Internet]. 2021;21(1):141. DOI: 10.1186/S12911-021-01493-Y
 30. Coalson JE, Anderson EJ, Santos EM, Garcia VM, Romine JK, Luzingu JK, et al. The Complex Epidemiological Relationship between Flooding Events and Human Outbreaks of Mosquito-Borne Diseases: A Scoping Review. *Environ Health Perspect* [Internet]. 2021;129(9):096002. DOI: 10.1289/EHP8887
 31. Dey SK, Rahman M, Howlader A, Siddiqi UR, Uddin KMM, Borhan R, Rahman EU. Prediction of dengue incidents using hospitalized patients, metrological and socio-economic data in Bangladesh: A machine learning approach. *PLoS ONE* [Internet]. 2022;17(7):e0270933. DOI: 10.1371/JOURNAL.PONE.0270933
 32. Organización Panamericana de la Salud. Estrategia para la prevención y el control de las enfermedades arbovirales. Washington DC (USA): PAHO/WHO; 2016. Available from: <https://iris.paho.org/handle/10665.2/31412>
 33. Desjardins MR, Casas I, Victoria AM, Carbonell D, Dávalos DM, Delmelle EM. Knowledge, attitudes, and practices regarding dengue, chikungunya, and Zika in Cali, Colombia. *Health Place* [Internet]. 2020;63:102339. DOI: 10.1016/J.HEALTHPLACE.2020.102339
 34. Hernández Y, Castro M, Pérez S, Pérez A, Lloyd LS, Pérez D. Comunicación para la prevención de arbovirosis: adecuación de iniciativas de la OPS al contexto cubano. *Rev Panam Salud Publica* [Internet]. 2018;42:e146. DOI: 10.26633/RPSP.2018.146
 35. Vega-Casanova J, Vega-Estarita L, Arroyave-Cabrera J. Lecciones aprendidas en la comunicación en salud y de riesgo en el manejo del virus del Chikungunya y otras enfermedades transmitidas por el mismo vector. *Revista Científica Salud Uninorte* [Internet]. 2016;32(1):35–55. DOI: 10.14482/SUN.32.1.8472
 36. Ogunlade ST, Adekunle AI, Meehan MT, McBryde ES. Quantifying the impact of Wolbachia releases on dengue infection in Townsville, Australia. *Sci Rep* [Internet]. 2023;13(1):14932. DOI: 10.1038/s41598-023-42336-2